

Heritage Resources Impact Assessment of the Gathercole Property in Saskatoon, Saskatchewan

Prepared For: City of Saskatoon

Prepared By: Kristin M. Enns-Kavanagh Nathan P. Friesen Stantec Consulting Ltd. 100 – 75 24th Street East Saskatoon, SK S7K 0K3 www.stantec.com

November 22, 2002 File: 132-52458.01

Copyright[©] Stantec Consulting Ltd., 2002

Executive Summary

In October of 2002, the City of Saskatoon asked Stantec Consulting Ltd. to conduct Heritage Resources Impact Assessment (HRIA) of the Gathercole Property, located in the south downtown of Saskatoon at the corner of 3rd Avenue and 19th Street. Previous studies of the area (Amundson, Champ and Brandon 1994; Enns-Kavanagh and Friesen 2002) have documented the presence of FaNp-26, the Clinkskill House Site. This site consists of a historic house foundation belonging to James Clinkskill, the first mayor of Saskatoon. This site was also noted to have a sparse precontact component. The HRIA of FaNp-26 on the Gathercole property was designed to do two things. First, it was designed to assess the extent and significance of the precontact component of the site. Second, it was designed to generate recommendations for mitigation of both the Clinkskill House foundation and any significant precontact remains, in the event of impact by development.

A total of 10 test excavations were dug. Based on previous studies conducted in 1994 and 2002, a detailed understanding of the stratigraphy of the area had already been obtained. Therefore, a skid-steer (Bobcat) tractor with a 12" auger was used to quickly excavate the 10 holes. All soil was screened through 4 mesh. No further evidence of the precontact component of the site was found. A small sample of historic artifacts generally relating to the presence of the Clinkskill House and it's destruction in 1960 were collected (wire drawn nails, brick and mortar fragments, ceramics and metal). No further features of the Clinkskill yard, beyond the house itself, were noted.

It was concluded, first, that the precontact component of FaNp-26 was not significant and did not warrant mitigation in the event of impact.

Second, it is recommended that, in the event of any ground disturbance within a ten metre radius of the center of the Clinkskill foundation, the site be mitigated with an as-found recording. This would involve the exposure of as much of the foundation remains as possible, and the creation of a detailed map of the same. It is also recommended that, during the excavations of the Clinkskill house, this excellent opportunity for public education about archaeology and Saskatoon history be utilized to its full extent.

Stantec

November 22, 2002

Table of Contents

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	
1.0	INTRODUCTION
1.1	BACKGROUND AND PROJECT GOALS
2.0	THE STUDY AREA
2.1	LOCATION OF THE GATHERCOLE PROPERTY
2.2	PREVIOUS ARCHAEOLOGICAL RESEARCH AT THE GATHERCOLE PROPERTY
2.3	HISTORY OF THE GATHERCOLE PROPERTY
2.4	ENVIRONMENT AND SITE SETTING
3.0	METHODOLOGY
3.1	ARCHAEOLOGICAL TESTING AT THE GATHERCOLE PROPERTY
3.2	EVALUATION OF ARCHAEOLOGICAL RESOURCES
4.0	RESULTS AND RECOMMENDATIONS
4.1	FaNp-26, THE CLINKSKILL HOUSE SITE
5.0	SUMMARY OF RECOMMENDATIONS
6.0	REFERENCES

Stantec

November 22, 2002

TABLE OF CONTENTS

List of Figures

Following Section 6

FIGURE 1 Location of the Gathercole Property, Saskatoon, Saskatchewan

FIGURE 2 Location of HRIA Test Excavations on the Gathercole Property

List of Photographs

Following Section 6

Photo 1 Excavating at the Gathercole Property

Photo 2 Excavating at the Gathercole Property - Screening for Artifacts

1.0 Introduction

1.1 BACKGROUND AND PROJECT GOALS

In October of 2002, the City of Saskatoon asked Stantec Consulting Ltd. to conduct Heritage Resources Impact Assessment (HRIA) of the Gathercole Property, located in the south downtown of Saskatoon at the corner of 3rd Avenue and 19th Street. Previous studies of the area (Amundson, Champ and Brandon 1994; Enns-Kavanagh and Friesen 2002) had documented the presence of FaNp-26, the Clinkskill House Site. This site consists of a historic house foundation belonging to James Clinkskill, the first mayor of Saskatoon. This site was also noted to have a sparse precontact component.

The HRIA of FaNp-26 on the Gathercole property was designed to do two things. First, it was designed to assess the extent and significance of the precontact component of the site. Second, it was designed to generate recommendations for mitigation of both the Clinkskill House foundation and any significant precontact remains, in the event of impact by development.

Stantec

November 22, 2002 1.1

2.0 The Study Area

2.1 LOCATION OF THE GATHERCOLE PROPERTY

The Gathercole property is located in fractional section 28, Township 36, Range 5, West of the 3rd Meridian (Figure 1). The property is bordered to the north by Clinkskill Manor, a senior's high-rise, and the Canadian Legion, both of which face onto 19th Street. To the east, the area is bordered by 3rd Avenue South. The former First Avenue South and the Idylwyld overpass form the western boundary, while the south is bordered by the South Saskatchewan riverbank (formerly part of Spadina Crescent East). The legal description for the area was formerly Plan Q2, Block 145, which was changed to Parcel B in 1940 (Amundson, Champ, and Brandon 1994). The project area, as of 1990, was described as Parcel M.

FaNp-26, the Clinkskill House Site, is located in a small park area at the far east of the property. The park is located at the corner of 19th Street and 3rd Avenue (Figure 2). The house foundation remains themselves are visible as a shallow depression at the extreme south end of the park.

2.2 PREVIOUS ARCHAEOLOGICAL RESEARCH AT THE GATHERCOLE PROPERTY

In 1994, the City of Saskatoon asked Sentar Consultants Ltd. (now Stantec Consulting Ltd.) to prepare a detailed report on the South Downtown area, of which the Gathercole Property is a part. The report included the 19th Street Site (FaNp-25), The Saskatoon Bottling Works Site (FaNp-24), and the Clinkskill House Site (FaNp-26), as well as the Sanatorium Site (FaNq-65). A detailed history of South Downtown area was prepared. Using Henderson's directories, photographs, and fire insurance maps found in the Local History Room of the Saskatoon Public Library, a structural history of the block was compiled. Following this, detailed searches were done on the individual lots which once existed on the property, using the Local History Room at City Hall, the Western Development Museum, and the City of Saskatoon Archives (Amundson, Champ, and Brandon 1994).

Test excavations were conducted at each of the sites noted above. With specific reference to the Clinkskill House Site, which is the focus of the current study, several recommendations were made. At the Clinkskill House area, a portion of the foundation of the house was uncovered. This site was deemed to be of high significance, being the residence of a prominent early Saskatoon mayor and businessman (see below). The possibility of precontact remains were also noted.

Stantec

November 22, 2002 2.1

THE STUDY AREA

Therefore, further assessment was recommended in advance of development at this site.

In conducting the current project, this 1994 study was reviewed extensively, particularly as pertaining to the history of the Clinkskill House. The following summary of the property's history is excerpted from the 1994 document.

2.3 HISTORY OF THE GATHERCOLE PROPERTY

The following is excerpted from Archaeological Survey of the South Downtown and the Sanatorium Site (Amundson, Champ, and Brandon 1994).

General History of the Study Area

Saskatoon was founded in 1882 on the east side of the South Saskatchewan River by the Temperance Colonization Society. In 1889, the Qu'Appelle, Long Lake, and Saskatchewan Steamboat and Railway Company (QLLSR) was offered a partnership in a new townsite on the west bank of the river in exchange for a right-of-way on which to set up a station and roundhouse. The west townsite of Saskatoon was surveyed in 1890 by the Temperance Colonization Society and QLLSR. It consisted of eighteen city blocks, bounded on the east and south by the river, on the north by Twenty-Third Street, and on the west by the rail line. All lots, except those facing the river on Spadina Crescent, were 25 feet wide and 140 feet deep fronting on an avenue or 130 feet deep fronting on a street (Kerr and Hanson 30).

In August 1891, four non-resident businessmen (James Campbell White of Hamilton, Augustus Meredith Nanton of Winnipeg, and Charles Powell and Edmund Boyd Osler--both of Toronto) purchased the fractional Section 28. Block 145 was part of this section of land. Over the years, lots on this block were sold to various individuals and organizations (Land Titles Office, records for Plan Q2, Block 145).

Saskatoon was incorporated as a town in 1903. Block 145 developed into a neighborhood of mixed character, with both commercial and residential buildings. Private homes, including the home of James Clinkskill (a pioneer merchant and Saskatoon's mayor in 1906, 1911 and 1912) and Knox Presbyterian Church were constructed along Spadina Crescent East. First Avenue South and Nineteenth Street East was a commercial district with businesses such as the Saskatoon Bottling Works, a livery stable, a blacksmith shop, automobile garages, and boarding houses.

Stantec

In 1911, the first Chinese business moved onto Block 145. Lee Lee (merchants) set up shop in a former residence at 123 Nineteenth Street East (Lot 23) (Lee Lee stayed at this location until 1931 or 1932; the business relocated to 332 Avenue C South in 1933). By the early 1920s, this area had become Saskatoon's "Chinatown." The

November 22, 2002 2.2

THE STUDY AREA

Chinese homes and businesses on Block 145 were located along Nineteenth Street East and First Avenue South; no Chinese were located on Spadina Crescent East. The most significant Chinese building on this block was 129 Nineteenth Street East, home of the Chinese National League (see below). Other businesses included restaurants, grocery stores and general merchants. Although there were twenty-three Chinese laundries in Saskatoon in 1912, there is only one Chinese laundry listed in the city directory on Block 145: Hop Lee's laundry at 410 First Avenue South (Lot 29) from 1913 to 1917.

Another significant change on Block 145 took place in 1911. Saskatoon's mayor, James Clinkskill, sold his house and Lots 13, 14 and 15 to the federal government for the construction of an armouries for the 29th Saskatchewan Light Horse Regimental Headquarters and the 105th Fusiliers division. Building Permit records indicate that \$10,000 was spent on the Armory in 1922. The Clinkskill house remained standing next to the armouries until 1960 where it was used as the officers' mess and as the home of the United Services Institute for former officers of the Canadian Armed Forces (see Clinkskill house, below).

The face of Block 145 changed dramatically with the construction of the Saskatoon Technical Collegiate, now known as the Gathercole Centre (on Lots 1 to 11, see below) in 1930, and the Saskatoon Arena in 1937 (on Lots 23 to 33). The Arena was torn down in 1989. In 1993, a senior's high-rise was constructed on the site of the former Arena.

The Clinkskill House Site

152 Spadina Crescent East (Lots 13 to 15): The mayor of Saskatoon (1906, 1911 and 1912), James Clinkskill, owned a large white frame house with a large, two-story veranda overlooking the South Saskatchewan River on this lot from 1904 to 1911. The house was located on Lot 14; the other two lots were Clinkskill's front and back yards (for a total of 225 feet by 200 feet). Clinkskill, his wife, their seven daughters and one son, had previously lived above his store on 21st Street. By 1904, his business was doing well, and he purchased the corner lots for five hundred dollars from the townsite trustees. "In the absence of a local architect," Clinkskill wrote in his memoirs, "I procured a book of architects' sketches and selecting the style of house we fancied I proceeded to draw my own plans." (As quoted in Dallas, p. 11) The home, which had a living room, dining room, breakfast room, a bedroom and kitchen on the first floor, and five bedrooms and a bathroom on the second floor, was built for six thousand dollars. The Clinkskill family hosted many social gatherings in their home, including dances to which as many as sixty young people were invited (Dallas, p. 18).

Stantec

November 22, 2002 2.3

THE STUDY AREA

In 1911, the Armouries were constructed on Lots 13 and 14. A Sergeant's Mess was built on Lot 14 in 1912 for \$1,000 (Building Permit #1320). The Clinkskill house was used as the officer's mess. It also served as the home of the Armories' caretaker, Harry Chambers, throughout the 1920s. The United Services Institute, whose members were former members of the Canadian Armed Forces, later located in the former Clinkskill house and hosted many social events.

In 1922 R.W. Caswell applied, on behalf of the Department of the Militia in Ottawa, for permission to move a large barn (72 feet by 120 feet) from his farm to the Armories site to be used as a drill hall. This application was approved by the City of Saskatoon, despite a letter of protest from Edmund Lehmann, manager of Saskatoon General Electric on Nineteenth Street, that the barn would constitute an eyesore (CSA, D500, VIII.375.63, Building Permits (58), 1922. City Clerk to City Commissioner, 19 December 1922; Edmund Lehmann to City Commissioner, 10 February 1923). Building Permit #7521 was issued for this drill hall project, which cost \$10,000.

In 1960, when the Hugh Cairns VC armouries were built in another part of the city, the 19th Street Armories were sold to local businessman Harry Landa for \$2,000 and removed from the site; Stanetz Construction dismantled this building and used the material to construct a building for Landa on Avenue P. The Clinkskill house was sold for \$50 to be demolished or removed (Dallas, 12). Demolition Permit #202/60 was issued for the Clinkskill house on 8 March 1960.

The contractor listed on the permit form, Henry Rosler of Rosler Construction Ltd., was interviewed regarding the fate of the Clinkskill house. It was demolished. Some lumber from the house was salvaged; Rosler used it in the construction of his own home. According to Rosler, the specifications for the demolition project required that all debris on the site be completely cleaned up. Everything but some of the lumber went to the city dump.

References for this history section (from Amundson, Champ and Brandon 1994):

Primary Sources

South Downtown

Saskatoon Public Library, Local History Room

- Henderson's Directories
- Fire insurance maps, 1911, 1913, 1931 or 1937
- Clipping files
- Biography files



THE STUDY AREA

- Photographs
- Newspapers (microfilm)

Land Titles Office

- Title search: Plan Q2, Block 145, Lot 33

City Hall

- Leisure Services Department
- Planning Department
- Assessor's Department
- Civic Buildings and Grounds

City of Saskatoon Archives

- City Clerk's Correspondence:

Building Permits, D500 VIII Licensing Register, 1916-1941, Hotels, Rooming Houses

Fire Department Log Books, D503

Town Planning Commission, minutes, 1927 to 1930

Saskatchewan Western Development Museums

- Collections Department
- Research Department

Interviews

- Peter Holdstock, Civic Buildings and Grounds, City of Saskatoon
- Henry Rosler, Rosler Construction Ltd., Saskatoon

Secondary Sources

Bliss, Jacqueline. "The Gathercole Building (Saskatoon Technical Collegiate) 405 - 3rd Avenue South; Historical Overview," City of Saskatoon, 1990; revised 1992.

Crone, Ray. "The Unknown Air Force," in Saskatchewan History, Vol. XXX (1977), pp. 1-17.

Stantec

Dallas, Zoe. "The Clinkskill House," in Saskatoon History Review, Vol. 1 (1980), pp. 11-12.

THE STUDY AREA

Hunter, Jim. "Copland, Thomas," Local History Room, Biography Files.

Kerr, Don and Stan Hanson. Saskatoon: The First Half-Century Edmonton: NeWest, 1982.

Matlock, Brian. "The History of Saskatoon in Bottles," January 1976. [In the Local History Room, Saskatoon Public Library or the Library, Provincial Service Centre, Saskatchewan Western Development Museums.]

2.4 ENVIRONMENT AND SITE SETTING

The study area is located on the Saskatoon Terrace, a level sandy terrace that can be formally described as a fluvio-lacustrine plain (Walker 1992, Meewasin Valley Authority 1990). This area has tremendous potential for advancing knowledge of precontact archaeology. Several sites of both scientific and cultural significance have been discovered on the Saskatoon Terrace. Two such sites are the Gowen Sites, which consist of one habitation site and one bison kill site. Both sites are around 6000 years old. These sites are the type-site for a particular style of atlatl (throwing spear) projectile point. Therefore, there is a strong link between the Saskatoon Terrace and the discovery of significant precontact materials. It is for this reason that testing for the extent and significance of the precontact component at FaNp-26 is of such importance.

3.0 Methodology

3.1 ARCHAEOLOGICAL TESTING AT THE GATHERCOLE PROPERTY

A total of ten 50 cm test excavations were conducted on the property (Figure 2). In previous studies, careful hand-digging in 1 x 1 m squares was used to generate an understanding of the stratigraphic history of the entire site area, as well as the Gathercole property as a whole. With this detailed understanding of site stratigraphy already in place, it was possible to move to a method of excavation, which would allow for a much greater volume of tests in a shorter period of time. A skid-steer (Bobcat) tractor with and 12" auger was used to quickly excavate the tests to a depth of 2 m. The auger drilled down to this depth in three to four stages, removing the drill and dumping the accumulated soils from each stage in separate piles until a depth of 2 m was reached. Each pile was screened separately. Artifacts were collected and bagged according to the general stratum in which they were found. The location of each test excavation was recorded using a hand-held Global Positioning System receiver. The original goals of the project were to test both the park area and the parking lot to its south (Figure 2). However, it was discovered that the auger was not capable of drilling through the pavement of the parking lot, despite the creation of a pilot hole with a pickaxe. Therefore, it was decided to instead test a sample of the site area (the park) more intensively that originally intended. The park area was tested intensively, including the southernmost area on the edge of the parking lot, and revealed no significant precontact remains. On this basis it was decided that potential for significant remains under the parking lot was low.

3.2 EVALUATION OF ARCHAEOLOGICAL RESOURCES

In this study, assessment was made of the relative significance of the resources found. This assessment was used to aid in the development of management strategies, where necessary, for the resources at the Gathercole property.

Creating criteria with which to assign relative significance to historic resources has been noted to be a subjective and sometimes problematic endeavour (Burley 1982); however, the archaeological discipline has generally settled on two broadly defined categories of criteria for evaluating site significance: historical (or public) significance, and scientific significance (Burley 1982).

Stantec

Sites which have historical or public significance are those which have a known association with "historic individuals, events or socioeconomic patterns of importance to a particular region or locale" (Walker 1983: 130), or which have the potential to

November 22, 2002 3.1

METHODOLOGY

contribute to "a people's sense of history, place, integrity, religion and the like" (Burley 1982: 51-52). Also included in evaluation of historic or public significance is an assessment of a resource's educational or interpretive potential (Burley 1982).

Scientific significance refers to a resource's potential to "1) accurately advance the knowledge of past cultures, peoples, or events, 2) advance the knowledge of other disciplines and, 3) contribute to the solution of theoretical and/or methodological problems within archaeology/anthropology" (Burley 1982: 51).

4.0 Results and Recommendations

4.1 FaNp-26, THE CLINKSKILL HOUSE SITE

The goals of this HRIA, as stated above, are to assess the extent and significance of the precontact component of the site and generate recommendations for mitigation of both the Clinkskill House foundation and any significant precontact remains, in the event of impact by development.

No significant precontact remains were found despite intensive testing over the majority of the site area. Therefore, no further action is recommended with regards to the precontact component of FaNp-26.

The 2002 assessment of the Gathercole property (Enns-Kavanagh and Friesen 2002) found that there was some potential, not present in any other area of the site, for the early Saskatoon living surface on which the Clinkskill House was built to be intact (unlike other areas of the property, where grading and been extensive). In the current study, then, it was hoped that some intact features of the house yard (outbuildings or middens) might be found. However, intensive testing within the houselot area did not reveal any intact features of the Clinkskill yard.

Therefore, it is concluded that the only significant archaeological remains on the site consist of the Clinkskill House foundation itself.

The Clinkskill House was built in 1904 by James Clinkskill, the first mayor of Saskatoon and a prominent early Saskatoon businessman. Clinkskill, his wife, and their eight children lived in the house until 1911, when the lot became the location of the Saskatoon Armoury. The Clinkskill House was used as the officer's mess and as the home of the armories caretaker. In 1960, when the Armouries were moved to their current location, the house was sold and demolished. All of the debris from the house was cleaned up and taken to the dump or salvaged for other buildings, or pushed into the cellar and buried.

Today, the house foundation consists of a shallow depression approximately 10 m by 10 m, located at the south end of the park at the corner of 3rd Avenue and 19th Street (Figure 2).

Stantec

The Clinkskill House was the home of a prominent early Saskatoon businessman. It was used extensively for entertaining both by the Clinkskills and later by the United Services Institute, which was located in the house when it was part of the Armoury. As such, the house has excellent interpretive potential for early Saskatoon history.

November 22, 2002 4.1

RESULTS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

As well, its downtown location and proximity to the Meewasin Valley Interpretive Center makes it ideally situated to educate the public about archaeology and about the lives of early Saskatoon residents.

It should be noted, however, that a test excavation conducted in 1994 (Amundson, Champ, and Brandon 1994) found that the interior of the foundation is filled with debris from the demolition of the house in 1960. If the center of the foundation was excavated, then, there is the potential to simply generate a large volume of artifacts which relate to destruction activities and not to the lives of the Clinkskills or any of the house's later inhabitants

Therefore, in the event of any ground disturbing activities within a 10 m radius of the center of the foundation, it is recommended that the resource undergo mitigation in the form of an as-found recording. This would involve exposing the foundations of the feature and making a detailed recording of them, as well as any other features present. Full excavation of the foundation is not recommended for the reasons stated above, namely, that such an excavation would generate a large and expensive volume of artifacts which would reveal very little about the life of the Clinkskill family.

It is also recommended that this excellent opportunity for public education be utilized to its full extent. School classes may wish to visit the site and to be given a guided tour of the proceedings. It is recommended that the Meewasin Valley Authority, whose offices and interpretive center are located right across the street from the site, be contacted to see if there is any interest from that organization with regards to coordinating tours or interpretive activities.

5.0 Summary of Recommendations

- 1) No further action is recommended with regards to the precontact component of FaNp-26.
- 2) In the event of any ground disturbance within a ten metre radius of the center of the Clinkskill foundation (see Figure 2), it is recommended that the site be mitigated with an as-found recording. This would involve the exposure of the foundations of the house and the detailed mapping and recording of the same. It is also recommended that this opportunity for public education on archaeological methods and early Saskatoon history be exploited though site tours and other interpretive activities.

Stantec

November 22, 2002 5.1

6.0 References

- Amundson, L.J., Joan Champ, and John Brandon. 1994. *Archaeological Survey of the South Downtown and the Sanatorium Site*. Report Prepared for the Meewasin Valley Authority.
- Bliss, Jacqueline. 1992. The Gathercole Building (Saskatoon Technical Collegiate) 405 3rd Avenue South; Historical Overview. City of Saskatoon, 1990; revised 1992.
- Burley, David. 1982. *Nipawin Reservoir Heritage Study, vol. 1.* SRC Publication No. C-805-5-E-82.
- Jones, Olive and Catherine Sullivan. 1989. *The Parks Canada Glass Glossary*. Studies in Archaeology, Architecture and History. National Historic Parks and Sites Branch, Parks Canada, Environment Canada, Ottawa.
- Meewasin Valley Authority. 1982. West Bank South Study; Strategic Concept Development Plan, Saskatoon. Report Prepared for the Meewasin Valley Authority.
- Walker. Ernest G. 1982. Archaeological Resource Assessment: The Tipperary Creek Project. Report on file with the Meewasin Valley Authority. Meewasin Valley Authority.
- Walker, E.G. 1992. The Gowen Sites. Canadian Museum of Civilization, Canada.

Stantec

November 22, 2002 6.1